

**Peer Editor:****Paper Writer:**

Please respond honestly and respectfully, and focus on helping the writer to improve this paper and future papers. Give the kind of feedback you would want. When you make an evaluation (“this is good; this needs work”), always explain your reasons, give specific examples, and make suggestions. Make marginal comments on the paper itself as appropriate, and staple the paper to the back of this sheet.

What is your overall impression of the paper? What are its main strengths?

**Thesis:**

Paraphrase the paper’s main point here.

Label the thesis statement in the first paragraph. Is it easy to find? Does it capture the paper’s main point?

Is the thesis sufficiently focused? If not, how would you alter its scope?

Is the thesis sufficiently objective? Does it adequately account for opposing arguments? If not, what counter-arguments should it address?

Do you find the thesis convincing? Does it pass the “says who” test?

Do you find the thesis interesting? Does it pass the “so what” and “who cares” tests?

**Structure:**

Does each body paragraph have a topic sentence which makes a claim that the ¶ then proves?

Read the thesis, followed by each topic sentence. Do the claims collectively pass the “so what” and “who cares” tests? Do they form a coherent argument? Should they be reorganized? How?

Can you easily determine how the topic sentences relate to each other (e.g. through clear transitions) and to the thesis? Does each paragraph build on the previous paragraph?

Is the textual evidence in each paragraph sufficient, necessary, and well-explained?

Is there a really good sentence buried somewhere which should be promoted to a topic sentence, or even to a thesis statement?

Does the conclusion add something to the paper? Does it answer a “so what” question?

**Style:**

What could be cut from this paper? Look for digressions, summary of the text, and wordiness.

What points in the essay are clearly written? Indicate any confusing points and suggest clarifications.

Did the writer proofread? Can you find grammar, spelling, punctuation, style, or citation format mistakes? If so, mark them on the paper itself.

**Final Comments:**

List the three most important things the writer can do to improve this paper:

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

Try to formulate the “so what” question that seems most important to you as a response to the argument of this paper. In other words, if this paper were the beginning of a larger investigation, where do you think it could or should lead? What are the most interesting implications of the paper’s argument?